

DRAFT #2b 091409

[date]

To: Mr. Lindsay Ball
Complex Area Superintendent

From: Bob Carroll, Chair
Task force to study the consolidation of Keanae and Hana Schools

Subject: Task force report on consolidation study and recommendation
Keanae and Hana Schools

This is the report of the task force you appointed pursuant to Chapter 8-38, Hawaii Administrative Rules, to study the possible consolidation of Keanae and Hana Schools.

Our recommendation is ... [to be completed following a public hearing]

We request that when the Board of Education meets to discuss and act on the possible consolidation of Keanae School, the meeting be held on Maui to afford community members the opportunity to attend and present testimony.

As provided by Chapter 8-38, your task force considered the following:

- (1) The advantages and disadvantages of consolidation in respect to efficient school administration and providing equal educational opportunity;
- (2) The adequacy of facilities, equipment, programs, transportation service, and other support services at the school which may be closed and the school to which students may be transferred;
- (3) Social impact on the children, schools, community and those involved in the consolidation;
- (4) The net financial savings that may be realized from consolidation, including projections of additional expenditures at the school which may receive transferred students;
- (5) Potential new residential developments, projected changes in enrollment, and other relevant demographic considerations;
- (6) Suitability of using portions of the school facilities to accommodate space requirements of other department or state activities; and
- (7) A suggested timetable for implementation if consolidation is recommended.
- (8) Other issues not specifically addressed in Chapter 8-38.

Your task force met on the following dates:

Thursday, July 23, 2009 from 3 to 5 p.m. at Keanae School
Thursday, August 27, 2009 from 5 to 6:53 p.m. at Keanae School

Thursday, September 17 from 4 to ____ p.m. at Keanae School
 [future meetings to be added]

These meetings were conducted in accordance with Chapter 92, Hawaii Revised Statutes (the “Sunshine Law”).

Your task force held a public hearing on its findings. The public hearing was held at _____ on _____ from __ to __ .m. A summary of the oral testimonies and copies of the written testimonies are attached in Appendix A.

The DOE has determined that the highest grade level that could be offered at Keanae would be the 5th grade, because neither the size of the student body nor the facilities at Keanae would be adequate to offer a middle school program at Keanae.

The DOE has also determined that it is not cost-effective to operate Keanae School as a free-standing school. As a free-standing school, Keanae School would require administrative staff, supervision by the complex area superintendent, If Keanae School were reopened as a K-5 “branch” of Hana School, the estimated enrollment would be 21, comprised of 13 current students in those grades now attending Hana School plus an estimated seven more students that would attend who are now homeschooled or otherwise do not attend Hana School because their parents do not want to subject them to the daily drive to and from Hana.

We therefore considered three possibilities:

- i) Keanae School is repopulated with K-5 classes as a “branch” of Hana School.
- ii) Status quo: the Keanae School facility remains under the control of the Hana School principal, but all Keanae students continue to attend school in Hana.
- iii) Keanae School is formally closed, and the facility is turned over to the Department of Land and Natural Resources.

Our findings follow, in the order listed above.

(1) The advantages and disadvantages of consolidation in respect to efficient school administration and providing equal educational opportunity.

Repopulate Keanae School with K-5 classes	
Advantages	Disadvantages
<u>Efficient school administration:</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • [are there any advantages?] 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • As a “branch” of Hana School, Hana administrators and Keanae teachers would need to spend time traveling between the two schools. •

<p><u>Providing equal educational opportunity:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Because students would be spending two hours fewer commuting to and from school, they would arrive at school less tired, more likely to have had breakfast, more ready to learn, and would have more time for homework and be less tired to do homework. • A multi-age organization of classes offers learning opportunities to both younger and older students in a class that are less available in a traditional graded school. • 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Because there would at most be two teachers at Keanae, the teacher(s) would need to teach a range of grade levels. • If the chemistry between student and teacher were detrimental to the student, there are limited opportunities to place students with a different teacher. • Separate quarterly standards are required to be taught for each grade level. This makes teaching multi-grade levels difficult.
---	---

(2) The adequacy of facilities, equipment, programs, transportation service, and other support services at Keanae School and at Hana Elementary School.

The two schools have the following facilities :

	Keanae		Hana	
	number	sq.ft.	number	sq.ft.
Total Number of Classrooms Buildings	1	2,578	16	53,704
Total Number of Classrooms:	4	2,578	40	53,704
classroom use	2	1,802	37	
other uses (list)				
Library	1			
Serving Kitchen	1	776		
Computer Lab			1	
Administration			0.5	
PSAP			0.5	
VOC-Tech			0.5	
Pihana Na Mamo			0.5	
Total Number of Non-Classroom Buildings	0		5	34,495
Admin. office			1	2,950
cafeteria/kitchen			1	5,790
Library			1	7,493
locker-shower			1	2,899
Gymnasium			1	15,363
Total sq.ft. all buildings		2,578		88,199

DOE’s criteria for determining the number of classrooms needed for instructional purposes are:

- * one classroom for each special education teacher
- * one classroom for every 20 students grades K-2
- * one classroom for every 25 students grades 3-5.

Based on these criteria, two classrooms would be needed at Keanae if it were reopened with 21 K-5 students. The Keanae facilities would physically accommodate the expected K-5 enrollment.

If Keanae school were reopened with 21 students and two teachers, furniture and equipment costing approximately \$22,000 would be needed at Keanae:

Furniture	\$12,000
Computers	7,000
Printer	1,200
Copier	1,200
Fax machine	300
Total	\$21,700

The condition of the Keanae facilities is poor. The building is an old frame termite-damaged building in need of substantial repair. The building was on the DOE’s list of “whole school renovation” projects, but the work for Keanae has been deferred pending a determination of the future of the school. The estimated cost to renovate the building is \$270,000.

The large capacity cesspool was replaced with a septic system in accordance with a consent agreement with the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency.

Hana School currently has the following teaching staff at the various grade levels:

	no. of students	no. of teachers
Special ed		
Pre-K	0	0
K-5	14	1
Grades 6-12	36	4
Regular ed		
Pre-K	14	1
K	44	2
Grade 1	35	2
Grade 2	21	1
Grade 3	32	2
Grade 4	15	1
Grade 5	24	1
Subtotal elementary	185	9
Grades 6-12	115	8
Total	350	18

The following programs and support services are now available at Hana [elementary level only]:

Four-day academic week (Monday-Thursday)
After-school tutoring three days per week
Two hours of tutoring Friday
Arts and cultural program Friday
School-community library on campus library on campus

Keanae students now attending Hana School who transferred back to Keanae would not receive the same the level of programs and support services.

Transportation is now (as of August 12, 2009) provided to 22 Keanae students who attend Hana School at the following grade levels:

Elementary K-2	9 students
Elementary 3-5	5 students
Middle 6-8	7 students
High 9-12	1 student

Because a bus would still be needed to transport students in grades 6-12 from Keanae to Hana if Keanae School were re-opened, re-opening Keanae School would not result in any student transportation savings.

There are no curb-to-curb special education students currently transported from Keanae to Hana.

(3) Social impact on the children, schools, community, and those involved in the consolidation.

If Keanae School were reopened, the 14 [or is it 13?] current students living in Keanae but attending Hana would not be subjected to the one hour each way commute to school. The positive impact on these students would be:

- They would be able to sleep an hour longer in the morning.
- They would be more likely to have breakfast with their families or at school, rather than skipping breakfast because they overslept or the bus arrived late at school.
- They would not be subjected to inappropriate behavior of older students on the school bus.
- They would not be exposed to the dangers of being in a vehicle traveling Hana Highway.
- They would not arrive at school with the effects of motion sickness.
- Their parents would be more able to pick them up at school if they became ill at school.
- They would not be subject to the stress of needing to use the toilet during a one-hour bus ride.

- They would not be subject to being stranded on the highway if the bus breaks down.
- Because they would not begin the bus commute to Hana School until the 6th grade, they would be less likely to drop out of high school because of too many years making the long bus ride to school.
- They would have more time after school for homework, chores, and family time.

The positive impact on the Keanae community if the school were reopened would be:

- A community bond provided by a school in the community: school-based activities would pull the community together.
- Increased feeling of community self-worth: the community feels valued because a school is provided for its young children.

However, there are social drawbacks to operating a small K-5 school at Keanae:

- Social interaction among students is more limited because there are fewer students.
- It is easier for students to be “labeled” and harder for them to shake the “label” if there is only one class per grade level, and if students remain in the same class for several years.

If Keanae School were “officially” closed and the facility turned over to the Department of Land and Natural Resources, the future uses of the facility would need to be worked out with DLNR

If Keanae School remained in its current “mothball” status – controlled by the DOE but with all Keanae students bussed to Hana – the potential would remain for the school to reopen in the future if enrollment warranted reopening.

(4) The net financial savings that may be realized from consolidation.

There are three analyses that are required: (a) the cost to continue to maintain Keanae School on a “mothball” status, (b) the savings that would result if Keanae School were formally closed, and (c) the cost if Keanae School were reopened.

The annual facility maintenance costs at Keanae are estimated at \$6,000, based on \$2.35 per sq.ft. of building area x 2,578 sq.ft. of building. The total DOE cost to maintain school facilities is \$105 million (see below) and the total DOE building area is 44.6 million sq.ft., so the cost of facility maintenance is about \$2.35 per sq.ft.

	Annual cost	Basis of calculation
Repair/maintenance lump sum	\$ 75,000,000	Amount needed to maintain backlog at a constant amount
Asbestos survey every three years	125,000	1/3 of most recent contract
Cash R&M projects (FDB)	4,000,000	2008-09 allocation from prog ID 37995
Work order repairs (FMB)	4,607,986	2008-09 allocation from prog ID 37995
Staff contracts (Aux Svc Branch)	5,914,312	2008-09 amount in prog ID 37995
U-fund payments to DAGS	1,000,000	2008-09 amount in prog ID 37995
DAGS 807	4,813,844	2008-09 appropriation
FMB	9,255,739	2008-09 amount in prog ID 37711
	\$104,716,881	

Keanae's future repair and maintenance and capital improvement project costs total approximately \$1,343,000:

Backlog projects	\$1,032,000
Current projects	<u>311,000</u>
Total	\$1,343,000

Details are in the following two tables:

Project Number	Project Name	Type	Status	Total Estimated Cost
E0601511	PKG 02-RESRF/RESTRP	R&M	Backlog	50,000
E0601965	RESURFACE PLAYCOURT	R&M	Backlog	100,000
E0602270	A PNT EXT	R&M	Backlog	46,000
E0602755	A PAINT FLOORS	R&M	Backlog	31,000
E0602757	01 REFENCE PLAYCRT	R&M	Backlog	15,000
E0602758	01 RPLC B RAIL STDS	R&M	Backlog	16,000
E0602760	A RPLC RR FIXT	R&M	Backlog	36,000
E0602762	A REROOF	R&M	Backlog	50,000
E0620192	A PAINT INT	R&M	Backlog	25,000
E0620364	A RPL WINDOWS	R&M	Backlog	50,000
E0620365	A RENOVATE KITCHEN	R&M	Backlog	46,000
E0620366	A RENOVATE RESTROOMS	R&M	Backlog	56,000
E0620914	CAMPUS RPL FENCING	R&M	Backlog	21,000
E0621305	A REWIRE BLD	R&M	Backlog	55,000
C0002405	ADA Transition Accessibility	CIP	Backlog	375,000
C0003127	Electrical Upgrade	CIP	Backlog	60,000
	Total			1,032,000

Project Number	Project Name	Type	Status	Total Estimated Cost
E0620010	A RMV PLAYGND EQPT	R&M		5,000
E0620915	A Rpr Sidewalk	R&M	Construction	26,000
E0621110	A STRUCTURAL STUDY	R&M		10,000
X5200307	2007 Whole School Renovations			270,000
	Total			311,000

The annual savings to the DOE that are likely to be realized if Keanae is closed and the facility were turnover to DLNR are approximately \$32,735:

	Annual amount	Basis of calculation
Elimination of electricity costs	960	12 mo cost to 7/17/09
Elimination of water costs	1,886	12 mo cost to 6/29/09
Elimination of custodial costs	23,831	0.5 FTE including fringes @ 37%
Elimination of building repair & maintenance costs	6,058	2.35/sq.ft. x 2,578 sq.ft.
Total	32,735	

The cost to operate a re-opened Keanae School would be approximately \$290,000 annually:

Position title	no. of positions	avg cost per position, incl fringes	total avg full cost
Teacher	2	77,095	154,189
Educational ass't	0	40,628	0
Driver	1	39,015	39,015
Cafeteria helper	0.5	37,950	18,975
Custodian	0.5	47,663	23,831
Food delivery van	1		17,886
Additional utility costs			5,000
Ongoing "mothball" costs			32,736
Total			291,632
Note: fringe rate is	37.04%		

If any of the Keanae students required special education services, it is possible that an additional teacher would be required at Keanae, at a cost of approximately \$77,000, plus a one-time cost of furniture and a computer of approximately \$5,000.

A portion of the \$291,632 cost of re-opening Keanae School would be incurred if the school were not reopened but continued to be "mothballed," so the appropriate analysis is

what additional cost would be incurred if the school were reopened. The additional cost, which assumes two teachers are transferred to Keanae from Hana and an additional educational assistant is hired at Hana, is approximately \$120,000:

Position title	no. of positions	avg cost per position, incl fringes	total avg full cost
Educational ass't	1	40,628	40,628
Driver	1	39,015	39,015
Cafeteria helper	0.5	37,950	18,975
Food delivery van	1		17,886
Additional utility costs			5,000
Total additional cost to re-open			121,504
Ongoing "mothball" costs			32,736
Cost to DOE to re-open vs turn over to DLNR			154,240

Testimony from parents at our task force meetings was that they would forego school-provided meals if Keanae School were reopened. However, the DOE is obliged to provide meals to any students eligible for free or reduced price meals [7 CFR part 210.23].

In summary, the annual costs to the DOE are:

Re-open Keanae School with 21 students	\$154,240
Continue to "mothball" Keanae School	32,736
Turn the facility over to DLNR	zero

The one-time costs to re-open Keanae School are:

Start-up costs to refurnish and re-equip Keanae School for 21 students and two teachers.	\$ 21,700
Costs to address deferred maintenance non-compliance with the provisions of the Americans with Disabilities Act.	<u>1,343,000</u>
Total	\$1,363,700

(5) Potential new residential developments, projected changes in enrollment, and other relevant demographic considerations.

The 25-year enrollment history of Keanae School is in the table below:

	Keanae grade levels	Keanae enrollment	Keanae enrollment per grade	Hana enrollment	combined enrollment	combined enrollment per grade
1983-84	K-8	37	4.1	317	354	27
1984-85	K-6	32	4.6	355	387	30
1985-86	K-5	25	4.2	392	417	32
1986-87	K-5	24	4.0	379	403	31
1987-88	K-5	24	4.0	388	412	32
1988-89	K-5	23	3.8	385	408	31
1989-90	K-5	14	2.3	362	376	29
1990-91	K-5	16	2.7	385	401	31
1991-92	K-5	13	2.2	419	432	33
1992-93	K-3	9	2.3	423	432	33
1993-94	K-3	7	1.8	434	441	34
1994-95	K-3	5	1.3	445	450	35
1995-96	K-3	9	2.3	438	447	34
1996-97	K-3	9	2.3	457	466	36
1997-98	K-3	7	1.8	440	447	34
1998-99	K-3	10	2.5	412	422	32
1999-2000	K-3	7	1.8	411	418	32
2000-01	K-3	3	0.8	402	405	31
2001-02	K-3	3	0.8	387	390	30
2002-03	K-3	6	1.5	389	395	30
2003-04	K-3	3	0.8	388	391	30
2004-05	K-3	7	1.8	384	391	30
2005-06				356	356	27
2006-07				357	357	27
2007-08				327	327	25
2008-09				334	334	26
2009-10				337	337	26

Elementary-level enrollment projections for the current year and upcoming six years at Hana (there are no projections available for Keanae) are:

Actual enrollment, 2008-09	334
Actual enrollment, 2009-10	337
Enrollment projected in fall 2008	
for 2009-10	323
for 2010-11	322
for 2011-12	324
for 2012-13	329
for 2013-14	338
for 2014-15	347

Projected enrollment at Hana is well below the capacity of the school and is below the enrollment for the 20-year period 1984-85 through 2005-06.

The Department of Hawaiian Home Lands owns land in Keanae that may in the future be developed for residential use, thereby generating additional students who might attend a school in Keanae. At this time DHHL's plans are indefinite.

(6) Suitability of using portions of the school facilities to accommodate space requirements of other department or state activities.

Some members of the Keanae community believe the current site of Keanae School was given to the Territory of Hawaii for school purposes. The DOE staff research shows that Keanae School is located on 3.53 acres of land owned by the State of Hawaii. It was conveyed to the Department of Public Instruction (DPI) of the Territory of Hawaii in two transactions. A fractional interest was conveyed by S.K. Kamaukoli, Mrs. Nele Elemakule, Mrs. Pro. Hookano, Mrs. Keahi Hookano, Joe Hookano, Anakolia Kawailohe, S.K. Makaena, and Akina on October 14, 1908. An additional fractional interest was conveyed by Ben Wilkins on November 30, 1909, when the Territory conveyed two government lots of 2.10 and 1.92 acres at Keanae to Mr. Wilkins in exchange for his conveyance to the DPI of his fractional interest in the 3.53-acre parcel.

Neither deed contains a reversionary clause.

The land was subsequently "set aside ... for the site for the Keanae School lot, to be under the control and management of the Department of Public Instruction" by executive order of Governor J.B. Poindexter on October 8, 1934.

A resolution introduced in the 2009 Legislature requested the DOE to turn the Keanae School facility to the Department of Land & Natural Resources.

[discussion of possible uses of Keanae School, including parent use as a homeschool presented in a classroom setting.]

(7) A suggested timetable and transition plan for implementation.

[discussion]

(8) Other issues not specifically addressed in Chapter 8-38.

[discussion]

Attachments:

A – Summary of oral testimonies and copies of written testimonies

B – Minutes of the task force meetings