

**Consolidation Study
Kalani Complex Elementary Schools**

This report is prepared pursuant to Chapter 8-38, Hawaii Administrative Rules, on the possible consolidation of elementary schools in the Kalani complex.

This study was initiated because it appeared, based on a comparison of enrollment at the Kalani complex elementary schools with the inventory of classrooms, that the supply of classrooms exceeded the current and projected enrollment by a sufficient margin to indicate that at least one of the existing elementary schools could be closed.

One of the elementary schools, Waialae, is a conversion charter school. It is included in this study because, although it is a charter school, as a conversion charter school it has a defined attendance area from which it must, like all Department of Education schools neighborhood schools, accept all students.

As provided by Chapter 8-38, this report considered the following:

- (1) The advantages and disadvantages of consolidation in respect to efficient school administration and providing equal educational opportunity;
- (2) The adequacy of facilities, equipment, programs, transportation service, and other support services at the school which may be closed and the school to which students may be transferred;
- (3) Social impact on the children, schools, community and those involved in the consolidation;
- (4) The net financial savings that may be realized from consolidation, including projections of additional expenditures at the school which may receive transferred students;
- (5) Potential new residential developments, projected changes in enrollment, and other relevant demographic considerations;
- (6) Suitability of using portions of the school facilities to accommodate space requirements of other department or state activities; and
- (7) A suggested timetable for implementation if consolidation is recommended.
- (8) Other issues not specifically addressed in Chapter 8-38.

The public hearing required by Chapter 8-38 was held on ____ [date] _____ at
____ [venue] _____.

The SY 2010-11 enrollment at the six Kalani complex elementary schools, and the capacity of the schools determined in May 2010 based on SY 2009-10 enrollments, were:

| | SY 2010-11 enrollment | SY 2009-10 capacity | Enrollment over or (under) capacity |
|--------------|-----------------------|---------------------|-------------------------------------|
| Kahala | 44 | 608 | (165) |
| Liholiho | 356 | 508 | (152) |
| Liliuokalani | 127 | 242 | (115) |
| Waialae | 406 | 616 | (210) |
| Waikiki | 426 | 467 | (41) |
| Wilson | 550 | 535 | 15 |
| Total | 2,308 | 2,976 | (668) |

Source: Enrollment is preliminary.

Source: SY 2009-10 capacity is from SY 2009-10 classroom utilization report, May 2010

The “capacity” figures in the table above assume that the non-school uses of classrooms will continue. These are the data for SY 2009-10:

| | number of classrooms | used by others or vacant | | | | | | used by school |
|--------------|----------------------|--------------------------|-------|-------|---------|--------|-------|----------------|
| | | district | state | gov't | private | vacant | total | |
| Kahala | 32 | 0.5 | | | | | 0.5 | 31.5 |
| Liholiho | 27 | | | | | | 0 | 27 |
| Liliuokalani | 24 | 2 | 4 | 2 | | | 8 | 16 |
| Waialae | 30 | | | | | | 0 | 30 |
| Waikiki | 25 | | | | | | 0 | 25 |
| Wilson | 29 | | | | | | 0 | 29 |
| Total | 167 | 2.5 | 4 | 2 | 0 | 0 | 8.5 | 158.5 |

Source: Classroom Utilization Report for SY 2009-10, May 2010

While at first blush it appears from the first table above that there is adequate capacity to close any one of the schools, or Liliuokalani School and Liholiho together, upon closer examination it would be difficult to close two schools simultaneously without significant disruption and adjustment of the attendance areas of most or all of the remaining schools.

This report, therefore considered only the closure of Liliuokalani School and the adjustment of the attendance areas of Waialae and Liholiho Schools to accommodate the Liliuokalani students.

The findings follow, in the order listed above:

(1) The advantages and disadvantages of consolidation in respect to efficient school administration and providing equal educational opportunity.

| Advantages of consolidation | Disadvantages of consolidation |
|---|---|
| <u>Efficient school administration:</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Closing Liliuokalani and transferring the students to the other two schools will eliminate one school administration. | |
| <u>Providing equal educational opportunity</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Closing Liliuokalani will increase the educational opportunities for Liliuokalani students that transfer to other schools that Liliuokalani, because of its small school is now unable to provide • | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The closure of Liliuokalani may reduce the leadership opportunities for elementary students at all schools that are affected. • The closure of a school will result in larger enrollments at the two “receiving” schools, which may reduce the feeling of “family” at any of the affected schools. |

Student achievement data

Student assessment data at the six schools are shown in the tables below. The data are for students at the school one year or longer.

Reading – percent of students proficient or better

| | Spring 2005 | Spring 2006 | Spring 2007 | Spring 2008 | Spring 2009 | Spring 2010 |
|--------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|
| Kahala | 80 | 83 | 86 | 88 | 85 | 89 |
| Liholiho | 66 | 62 | 68 | 70 | 78 | 84 |
| Liliuokalani | 42 | 50 | 59 | 58 | 61 | 62 |
| Waialae | 68 | 58 | 72 | 72 | 70 | 76 |
| Waikiki | 78 | 68 | 73 | 72 | 72 | 77 |
| Wilson | 67 | 73 | 72 | 77 | 82 | 80 |

Mathematics – percent of students proficient or better

| | Spring 2005 | Spring 2006 | Spring 2007 | Spring 2008 | Spring 2009 | Spring 2010 |
|--------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|
| Kahala | 61 | 59 | 83 | 82 | 79 | 86 |
| Liholiho | 34 | 39 | 54 | 68 | 75 | 79 |
| Liliuokalani | 32 | 41 | 52 | 58 | 58 | 50 |
| Waialae | 29 | 32 | 51 | 53 | 54 | 53 |
| Waikiki | 55 | 55 | 69 | 68 | 63 | 72 |
| Wilson | 42 | 57 | 64 | 73 | 77 | 75 |

Adequate yearly progress data

The six schools have consistently made adequate yearly progress under the federal No Child Left Behind Act (NCLB). All six schools have consistently been “In good standing, unconditional.”

The number of adequate yearly progress targets that have been met at each school has been:

| | Spring 2005 | Spring 2006 | Spring 2007 | Spring 2008 | Spring 2009 | Spring 2010 |
|--------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|
| Kahala | 9/9 | 9/9 | 9/9 | 9/9 | 9/9 | 9/9 |
| Liholiho | 9/9 | 11/11 | 11/11 | 11/11 | 11/11 | 13/13 |
| Liliuokalani | 3/3 | 9/9 | 9/9 | 9/9 | 9/9 | 9/9 |
| Waialae | 9/9 | 9/9 | 13/13 | 13/13 | 13/13 | 9/9 |
| Waikiki | 9/9 | 13/13 | 13/13 | 15/15 | 13/13 | 13/13 |
| Wilson | 9/9 | 9/9 | 9/9 | 9/9 | 9/9 | 9/9 |

Discussion of the affect on schoolwide student achievement of the percentage of economically disadvantaged students

Nationally and in Hawaii there is a correlation between the percentage of students who are academically proficient, measured by the percentage who are proficient in reading and mathematics, and the percentage of students who are economically disadvantaged, measured by students who are eligible for free and reduced price school meals. There is also a correlation between the percentage of economically disadvantaged students who are academically proficient and the percentage of economically disadvantaged students in the school population: the higher the percentage of students who are economically disadvantaged, the lower the percentage of economically disadvantaged students who are academically proficient.

Additionally, the percentage of students in special education programs, and the percentage of students whose English language proficiency is limited have an effect on schoolwide student achievement. The percentage of students at the six schools who are economically disadvantaged, in special education programs, and of limited English language proficiency are in the table below. All three “subgroups” are too small at four of the schools for the student achievement results of the subgroups to be separately reported for any of the six years. For the most recent three years, only Waialae and Waikiki have sufficiently large subgroups of economically disadvantaged students to report data for this subgroup. Student demographics for all six schools (percentages of the student body that are economically disadvantaged, receiving special education services, and having limited English proficiency) are in **Table 1** at the end of this report. Data showing the achievement gap between students who are economically disadvantaged and students who are not economically disadvantaged for Waikiki and Waialae are in **Table 2**.

Discussion of class size

Frequently-cited research conducted in Tennessee (Project STAR, 1985-1989) and Wisconsin (SAGE program, 1996 to the present) indicates that kindergarteners and first graders learn more reading and mathematics in classes smaller than 17 students than in classes larger than 25 students. A subsequent study (Ready and Lee, 2006) found that kindergarten literacy and mathematics learning, and first grade mathematics learning, are not different in medium-sized classes (17 to 25 students) than in small classes, although small first grade classes show more literacy learning than medium-sized first grade classes. Rather than “small is good,” Ready and Lee conclude that “large is bad.”

These researchers suggest that it may not be class size *per se* that influences student learning, but rather the pedagogical approaches – more individualized teaching – and better classroom disciplinary environment that typify smaller classrooms.

Compared to small schools, larger schools typically:

- Offer more educational programs and extra-curricular options.
- Have a greater ability to create individual classes that are heterogeneous.
- Can better match students with teachers.
- Can separate students who would be more successful socially and/or academically if they were in separate classes.
- Have a greater variety of students who bring diverse experiences to their fellow students.
- Offer teachers greater opportunities to collaborate and reflect on practice with other teachers at the same grade level.

Discussion of school size

The research of Ready and Lee (2006) indicates that literacy learning is lower in large schools (more than 800 students). Consensus among researchers identifies elementary schools with enrollment of 300 to 400 students as optimal.

Closing Liliuokalani and dividing the 114 K-5 students between Liholiho and Waialae would have resulted in schools sizes in SY 2009-10 shown in the table below.

| | Actual enrollment | Adjustment | Pro forma enrollment |
|----------------------|-------------------|------------|----------------------|
| Kahala | 443 | | 443 |
| Liholiho | 356 | + 57 | 420 |
| Liliuokalani K-5 | 114 | -114 | 0 |
| Liliuokalani grade 6 | 13 | - 13 | 0 |
| Waialae | 406 | + 57 | 469 |
| Waikiki | 426 | | 426 |
| Wilson | 550 | | 550 |
| Total | 2,308 | - 13 | 2,295 |

The enrollments of the six schools are projected to remain fairly steady in school year 2014-15, if the schools are not consolidated. (See enrollment projections in Section 5 below.)

(2) The adequacy of facilities, equipment, programs, transportation service, and other support services at the six elementary schools

The current enrollment (SY 2009-10 official enrollment) at the six schools is:

| | Kahala | | | Liholiho | | | Liliuokalani | | |
|---------|--------|------|-------|----------|------|-------|--------------|------|-------|
| | Reg | SpEd | Total | Reg | SpEd | Total | Reg | SpEd | Total |
| K | 83 | 2 | 85 | 71 | 4 | 75 | 17 | 2 | 19 |
| grade 1 | 73 | 5 | 78 | 57 | 2 | 59 | 14 | 2 | 16 |
| grade 2 | 76 | 4 | 80 | 45 | 3 | 48 | 12 | 1 | 13 |
| grade 3 | 72 | 5 | 77 | 62 | 3 | 65 | 21 | 2 | 23 |
| grade 4 | 58 | 8 | 66 | 55 | 4 | 59 | 17 | 2 | 19 |
| grade 5 | 52 | 5 | 57 | 46 | 4 | 50 | 22 | 2 | 24 |
| grade 6 | | | | | | | 11 | 2 | 13 |
| Total | 414 | 29 | 443 | 336 | 20 | 356 | 114 | 13 | 127 |

| | Waialae | | | Waikiki | | | Wilson | | |
|---------|---------|------|-------|---------|------|-------|--------|------|-------|
| | Reg | SpEd | Total | Reg | SpEd | Total | Reg | SpEd | Total |
| K | 89 | 1 | 90 | 102 | 6 | 108 | 80 | 2 | 82 |
| grade 1 | 81 | 0 | 81 | 61 | 2 | 63 | 89 | 3 | 92 |
| grade 2 | 64 | 1 | 65 | 67 | 2 | 69 | 87 | 5 | 92 |
| grade 3 | 45 | 8 | 53 | 38 | 6 | 44 | 78 | 12 | 90 |
| grade 4 | 63 | 6 | 69 | 53 | 8 | 61 | 86 | 7 | 93 |
| grade 5 | 47 | 1 | 48 | 50 | 5 | 55 | 91 | 10 | 101 |
| grade 6 | | | | 21 | 5 | 26 | | | |
| total | 389 | 17 | 406 | 392 | 34 | 426 | 511 | 39 | 550 |

A significant percentage of the students at these schools live outside the Kalani complex attendance area. Approximately half of the students enrolled in the five DOE schools at of August 23, 2010 and at Waialae as of September 1, 2010 do not live in the Kalani complex attendance area.

| | Kahala | Liholiho | Liliuokalani | Waialae | Waikiki | Wilson | Total |
|--|--------|----------|--------------|---------|---------|--------|-------|
| Outside Kalani area | 247 | 155 | 33 | 205 | 236 | 281 | 1,157 |
| In Kalani area but outside school area | 60 | 24 | 5 | 59 | 14 | 107 | 269 |
| In school area | 123 | 197 | 64 | 160 | 184 | 198 | 926 |
| Total | 430 | 376 | 102 | 424 | 434 | 586 | 2,352 |
| Percentages | | | | | | | |
| Outside Kalani area | 57% | 41% | 32% | 48% | 54% | 48% | 49% |
| In Kalani area but outside school area | 14% | 6% | 5% | 14% | 3% | 18% | 12% |
| In school area | 29% | 53% | 63% | 38% | 43% | 34% | 39% |
| Total | 100% | 100% | 100% | 100% | 100% | 100% | 100% |

The table below shows the number of students living in each school's attendance area and attending a school within the Kalani complex. It does not include students living outside the Kalani attendance area, nor does it consider students living in the Kalani attendance area but attending a school outside the Kalani attendance area. The DOE's system is not yet able easily to identify students who live in the Kalani attendance area but attend school outside the Kalani attendance area. These data indicate that, if it were not for geographic exceptions, the 1,195 students living within the Kalani attendance area and attending Kalani elementary schools could be accommodated within any three of the six schools in the complex. Please refer to the table of school capacities on page 2 above.

| Living in school's attendance area ↓ | School attending | | | | | | |
|--------------------------------------|------------------|----------|--------------|---------|---------|--------|-------|
| | Kahala | Liholiho | Liliuokalani | Waialae | Waikiki | Wilson | Total |
| Kahala | 123 | 2 | 0 | 4 | 2 | 11 | 142 |
| Liholiho | 10 | 197 | 0 | 7 | 5 | 16 | 235 |
| Liliuokalani | 13 | 6 | 64 | 26 | 6 | 44 | 159 |
| Waialae | 16 | 8 | 4 | 160 | 1 | 26 | 215 |
| Waikiki | 9 | 6 | 1 | 11 | 184 | 10 | 221 |
| Wilson | 12 | 2 | 0 | 11 | 0 | 198 | 223 |
| Total | 183 | 221 | 69 | 219 | 198 | 305 | 1,195 |

The percentage of special education students at the six schools in SY 2009-10 was 6.6% and ranged from 4% to 10%, compared to the statewide average of the special education population in K-6 schools of 8%. The individual school data are unremarkable, and can be found in **Table 3**.

The six schools have the following facilities:

| | Kahala | Liholiho | Liliuokalani | Waialae | Waikiki | Wilson |
|-------------------|--------|----------|--------------|---------|---------|--------|
| No. of classrooms | 32 | 27 | 24 | 31 | 24 | 29 |
| Sq. ft of: | | | | | | |
| Office | 8,902 | 6,317 | 7,021 | | 6,528 | 5,839 |
| Cafeteria | 7,176 | 4,486 | 4,859 | | 6,919 | 7,696 |
| Total | 16,078 | 10,783 | 12,872 | | 13,447 | 13,535 |

Details are in **Table 4** at the end of this report.

Food service

Meals for both Liholiho and Liliuokalani are delivered from Anuenue School. The other four Kalani complex elementary schools have preparation kitchens. As a conversion charter school, Waialae sets its meal prices independent of the DOE. For the first semester of SY 2010-11, meal prices are:

| | Breakfast | | Lunch | |
|---------------|-----------|-------------|---------|-------------|
| | Waialae | DOE schools | Waialae | DOE schools |
| Students | | | | |
| Full price | \$1.25 | \$0.95 | \$3.00 | \$2.20 |
| Reduced price | \$0.30 | \$0.30 | \$0.40 | \$0.40 |
| Free | Free | Free | Free | Free |
| Second meal | \$2.75 | \$1.90 | \$4.25 | \$4.40 |
| Adults | \$2.75 | \$1.90 | \$4.25 | \$4.40 |

Liliuokalani students who transfer to Waialae will pay the Waialae meal prices.

To the extent that Liliuokalani students transfer to Waialae instead of Liholiho, the number of meals prepared at Anuenue will decrease, which may affect the level of cafeteria staff employment at Anuenue.

[additional discussion once average daily meal data for Liliuokalani for SY 09-10 is available]

Student transportation

There may be few significant student transportation issues in the analysis of school consolidation alternatives. The DOE does not provide school bus service in urban Honolulu. Students eligible for free or reduced price meals are also eligible for free City bus passes if they live more than one mile from school (1.5 miles for 6th graders). If the consolidation results in more students becoming eligible for free City bus passes, the cost is approximately \$300 per student per year.

For Liliuokalani students receiving curb-to-curb transportation services, the additional distance a student would need to be transported if Liliuokalani were closed is inconsequential.

(3) Social impact on the children, schools, community, and those involved in the consolidation.

School consolidation is difficult, irrespective of the logic that supports it. Liliuokalani students, parents, alumni, and staff will feel a sense of loss if the school is closed. Receiving schools will need to make adjustments.

Lilioukalani School has a long and rich history, The site for the school was purchased by the Territory of Hawaii in 1911, and it is reported that the cornerstone for the first school building on the site was dedicated by the queen herself.

Nature abhors a vacuum. Schools with extra space rarely leave it vacant. Use expands to fill space that is available. While space is available at the receiving schools to accommodate the increased enrollment that would result if Liliuokalani were closed, that space is currently used. Those who are using that space currently, as well as others at the receiving schools whose use of space will change as the school enrollment expands, will be affected by the consolidation.

If the future use of the Liliuokalani campus is for a school, there will likely be little impact on the community. If the future use of the Liliuokalani campus is for offices, there will likely be a reduction of before-school student drop-off and after-school student pick-up traffic, but there will likely be an increased demand for parking during the workday. A net increase in the number of adults on the campus will likely affect retailers in Kaimuki, some positively and some negatively depending on their clientele.

The DOE employees at Liliuokalani as of May 2010 were:

| | No. of employees | FTE |
|------------------------------|------------------|------|
| Principal | 1 | 1.0 |
| Student services coordinator | 1 | 1.0 |
| Clerical | 2 | 1.0 |
| Counselor | 1 | 1.0 |
| Educational assistant | 7 | 7.0 |
| Elementary teacher | 8 | 8.0 |
| Special education teacher | 3 | 3.0 |
| SASA | 1 | 1.0 |
| Custodian | 2 | 2.0 |
| Health Aide | 1 | 1.0 |
| Total | 27 | 26.0 |

DOE guidelines for staff reductions for teachers are set forth in the DOE's School Code for Certificated Personnel on pages 5700-19 through 33 (amended December 2005). In summary, and at the risk of oversimplification, if Liliuokalani were closed and the students transferred to Liholiho and Waiālae, the following would apply and may be subject to further discussion between DOE and HSTA:

(a) Teachers at the closing school would have first priority to move with students to the schools to which the students were transferred, provided vacancies at receiving schools were available. If a closing school teacher chose not to move to with the transferring students, the teacher would be placed in a pool of unassigned staff reduced teachers.

(b) Teachers at the closing school who transfer to the receiving schools would carry their closing school seniority to the receiving school.

(c) Teachers at the closing school who are placed in a pool of unassigned staff reduced teachers would not carry over their closing school seniority to a new assignment.

(d) Staff reduced teachers would be reassigned by the complex area superintendent within the district. If reassignment within the district were not possible, the staff reduced teachers would be considered for placement in other districts.

(e) Teachers at the closing school with tenure and appropriate preparation for licensure may replace teachers at the receiving schools without tenure or permanent assignment.

(e) Staff reduced teachers may submit to the personnel regional officer a preferred list of not more than three schools, three geographic areas within the district and/or three districts within seven days of the decision by the BOE to close a school. This teacher will have priority for a vacant position in his/her area of certification over less senior tenured teachers in similar situations. If preference of placement is in another district, the teacher is to be considered after all unassigned tenured teachers in that district have been placed. If the teacher fails to accept any bona fide offer made by the DOE by May 1, the DOE may assign the teacher to an appropriate vacancy.

Staff reductions for school administrators are addressed in the DOE's contract with HGEA, Unit 6. Based on the length of service as an educational officer, displaced employees have the right to "bump" other educational officers with less service, or they may elect to waive this right and instead be placed in a vacant position. If an educational officer cannot be placed or refuses placement, he/she will be laid off and placed on a reemployment list, to be rehired when a position is available for which the employee is qualified.

Staff reductions for custodians (except the head custodian, who is in a different bargaining unit) and cafeteria workers (except the cafeteria manager, who is in a different union) are addressed in the DOE's contract with UPW. Based on the length of service in civil service with DOE, displaced employees may bump other employees in DOE in the same or lower class with less service, or they may elect to waive this right and instead be placed in a vacant position. If an employee cannot be placed, he/she will be laid off and placed on a recall list, to be rehired when a position in the same or lower class is available.

Staff reductions for HGEA members other than school administrators generally follow procedures similar to those described for custodians and cafeteria workers.

There are no contractual provisions governing staff reductions of hourly or casual employees.

(4) The net financial savings that may be realized from consolidation, including projections of additional expenditures that will be incurred as a result of consolidation.

The net annual financial savings, including the savings on fringe benefits, from closing Liliuokalani is approximately \$370,000, based on projected enrollment and costs for SY 2010-11, assuming:

- (a) The 127 projected Liliuokalani students are divided equally between Liholiho and Waialae.
- (b) There are no savings from closing the Liliuokalani campus, because the DOE will continue to use it.
- (c) There are no savings from combining the special education staffs.

Details are in **Table 5** at the end of this report.

Not included in the savings is the annual value of the space, if used for offices. The Liliuokalani campus has 36,180 sq.ft. of building space. Using a conservative value of \$1.20 per sq.ft. per month, net of all expenses, the space is worth about \$520,000 annually.

| | |
|---|---------------------|
| Classroom space 27 x 900 sq.ft./classroom | 24,300 sq.ft. |
| Office | 7,021 sq.ft. |
| Cafeteria | <u>4,859</u> sq.ft. |
| Total | 36,180 sq.ft. |

Because it is likely that the school facilities would continue to be used, funds programmed for facility maintenance and improvements will likely be spent even if the school is closed. Details of facilities projects for Liliuokalani are in **Table 6** at the end of this report.

(5) Potential new residential developments, projected changes in enrollment, and other relevant demographic considerations.

The 15-year enrollment history and six-year enrollment projections of the six schools is:

| School year | Kahala | Liholiho | Liliuokalani | Waialae | Waikiki | Wilson | total |
|-------------|--------|----------|--------------|---------|---------|--------|-------|
| 1995-96 | 626 | 376 | 175 | 467 | 317 | 522 | 2,483 |
| 1996-97 | 603 | 364 | 180 | 483 | 343 | 535 | 2,508 |
| 1997-98 | 607 | 405 | 169 | 488 | 334 | 543 | 2,546 |
| 1998-99 | 615 | 404 | 149 | 517 | 342 | 561 | 2,588 |
| 1999-2000 | 607 | 394 | 144 | 472 | 338 | 598 | 2,553 |
| 2000-01 | 596 | 368 | 159 | 450 | 326 | 587 | 2,486 |
| 2001-02 | 583 | 339 | 155 | 473 | 326 | 574 | 2,450 |
| 2002-03 | 512 | 327 | 149 | 489 | 336 | 542 | 2,355 |
| 2003-04 | 512 | 336 | 141 | 486 | 363 | 588 | 2,426 |
| 2004-05 | 523 | 346 | 125 | 468 | 340 | 613 | 2,415 |
| 2005-06 | 538 | 333 | 123 | 439 | 346 | 607 | 2,386 |
| 2006-07 | 540 | 342 | 124 | 405 | 371 | 619 | 2,401 |
| 2007-08 | 524 | 324 | 146 | 397 | 391 | 552 | 2,334 |
| 2008-09 | 445 | 345 | 130 | 412 | 403 | 567 | 2,302 |
| 2009-10 | 443 | 356 | 127 | 406 | 426 | 550 | 2,308 |
| 2010-11 | 442 | 368 | 126 | 392 | 428 | 535 | 2,291 |
| 2011-12 | 441 | 366 | 127 | 392 | 434 | 536 | 2,296 |
| 2012-13 | 442 | 365 | 127 | 392 | 443 | 534 | 2,303 |
| 2013-14 | 441 | 364 | 129 | 392 | 455 | 535 | 2,316 |
| 2014-15 | 441 | 363 | 128 | 392 | 466 | 533 | 2,323 |
| 2015-16 | 444 | 365 | 130 | 392 | 465 | 535 | 2,331 |

Note: During the historic period 6th grade had a varying status. While Kaimuki Middle School offered a 6th grade program, the elementary schools continued to offer 6th grade, although at most schools the 6th grade enrollment was lower than in the other grades, as some 6th graders opted to go to Kaimuki Middle. Waialae converted from K-6 to K-5 effective SY 2001-02, Liholiho effective SY 2007-08. Both Liliuokalani and Waikiki continue to offer 6th grade.

In earlier years, the enrollment at Liliokalani was higher, peaking at 246 in SY 1985-86.

Elementary enrollment has been relatively stable in the Kalani complex over the past 15 years. Historically, the elementary schools in the Kalani complex have maintained relatively stable enrollment by managing the number of students admitted on a geographic exception basis, despite the decline and eventual discontinuance at most elementary schools of a 6th grade program.,,

Projected enrollment (before consideration of the consolidation discussed in this report) for the upcoming six years is expected to be stable. It should be noted that the enrollment projections assume the schools will continue to replace the expected slow decrease in the school-age population within the schools' attendance areas with students admitted with geographic exceptions.

Little if any residential development, other than the ongoing tear-down of older houses and replacing them with larger homes is projected for the Kalani complex.

The current economic conditions in Hawaii have caused a number of small private schools to close, potentially increasing enrollment in the public schools. The enrollment

data for SY 2010-11 do not show any significant impact on enrollment in the Kalani complex elementary schools.

(6) Suitability of using portions of the school facilities to accommodate space requirements of other department or state activities.

School ownership and sizes are:

| | Tax map key no. | Acres | Titleholder |
|--------------|------------------|-------|--|
| Kahala | 3-5-11:27 | 6.593 | City & County |
| Liholiho | 3-2-21:35 | 3.673 | City & County |
| Liliuokalani | 3-2-37:27 | 2.698 | State |
| Waialae | 3-2-45:3 | 4.132 | City & County |
| Waikiki | 3-1-25:1 | 5.698 | State and City & County as tenants in common |
| Wilson | 3-5-17:12 (por.) | 5.946 | City & County |

The Territory of Hawaii acquired the land that is now Liliuokalani School from Charles A. Bidenger on May 11, 1911 for the sum of \$8,000. There are no restrictions in the deed on the use of the property.

In SY 2009-10 all but three classrooms were used by the schools:

| School | Classrooms used by other than the school | | | | |
|--------------|--|------|-------|------|-------|
| | DIST | GOVT | PRIVT | VACT | TOTAL |
| Kahala | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 |
| Liholiho | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 |
| Liliuokalani | 0.0 | 0.8 | 2.0 | 0.0 | 2.8 |
| Waialae | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 |
| Waikiki | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 |
| Wilson | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 |

Source: Classroom utilization report for SY 2009-10

The “outside” user of the two classrooms at Liliuokalani School is a preschool operated for children of University of Hawaii staff.

Act 144 of the 2010 Legislature requires the DOE to notify the Charter School Review Panel (“Panel”) not later than 30 days after the Board of Education votes to close a DOE school. The Panel must then solicit applications from charter schools interested in using all or portions of the school facility and submit a prioritized list of charter schools to the DOE. The DOE makes the final determination of which charter school, if any, shall be authorized to use and occupy the public school facilities. Upon the selection of a charter school to use a vacant school facility or portion of a school facility, the DOE and the Panel shall, within ninety days of the selection, enter into necessary agreements to enable the charter school to use the facility.

If no charter schools are interested, or if the DOE determines that no charter school on the list is an appropriate candidate to occupy and use the facilities, the DOE shall give reasonable consideration to making all or portions of the facilities of the public school, if closed, available for occupancy and use for other educational purposes. Act 144 requires the DOE to adopt administrative rules, and the Panel to adopt policies and procedures, to carry out their respective responsibilities under this bill.

A private school has expressed interest in renting the facilities of a Honolulu district school, if one is closed, the DOE does not plan to use it, and either no charter schools are interested in using it or the DOE determines that none of the interested charter schools is an appropriate candidate to use the school facility.

The DOE currently rents office space from private landlords. Also, DOE state office staff is scattered among a number of schools in the Honolulu district in a very inefficient pattern. The availability of a school campus in the Honolulu district would provide an opportunity for the DOE either to decrease the amount of commercial office space it now rents or to consolidate in a single location offices that are now scattered around the city.

Because of all the possible education-related uses described above, it is very unlikely that if Liliuokalani were closed, the facility would not continue to be used for educational purposes.

[discuss reversionary clause, if any, in deed to Liholiho; the other four school deeds have no reversionary clauses]

(7) A suggested timetable and transition plan for implementation.

A decision in the fall of 2010 to close Liliuokalani School would provide adequate time for the following activities:

(a) The administrators, teachers, and parents of current students at the affected schools would develop a transition plan, including which furniture, equipment, and supplies would need to be transferred from Liliuokalani to the receiving schools, and programs for parents and students at Liliuokalani to be introduced and welcomed to the receiving schools.

(b) Parents of current and prospective students would make choices for their children for SY 2011-12.

(c) Staff members at Liliuokalani School would, in accordance with the provisions of their bargaining unit contracts, make arrangements for their employment in SY 2011-12.

(d) The non-DOE preschool currently operating on the Liliuokalani campus would make arrangements for SY 2011-12.

(e) Pursuant to Act 144, the DOE would notify the Charter School Review Panel of the possible availability of the Liliuokalani School facility, the CSRP would notify charter schools of the possible availability, would receive responses (if any) from the charter schools, and would submit a prioritized list of interested charter schools to the DOE.

(f) The DOE would determine the use of the facility after the school closed, and would plan for the implementation of such use to minimize any gap in occupancy.

(8) Other issues not specifically addressed in Chapter 8-38.

a.

b.

Tables

1. Student demographics
2. Achievement gap between economically disadvantaged students and students who are not economically disadvantaged.
3. Percentage of students receiving special education services.
4. Facility details
5. Financial savings
6. Future facilities capital and major repair and maintenance costs for Liliuokalani.

1. Student demographics (percentage of students who are economically disadvantaged, receiving special education services, and having limited English language proficiency):

| Kahala Percentages | Spring 2005 | Spring 2006 | Spring 2007 | Spring 2008 | Spring 2009 | Spring 2010 |
|--------------------------------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|
| Economically disadvantaged | 5% | 3% | 4% | 6% | 8% | 11% |
| Special education | 5% | 6% | 5% | 6% | 8% | 8% |
| Limited English language proficiency | 5% | 5% | 7% | 14% | 18% | 15% |
| Whole school proficient in reading | 80% | 83% | 86% | 88% | 85% | 89% |
| Whole school proficient in math | 61% | 59% | 83% | 82% | 79% | 86% |

| Liholiho Percentages | Spring 2005 | Spring 2006 | Spring 2007 | Spring 2008 | Spring 2009 | Spring 2010 |
|--------------------------------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|
| Economically disadvantaged | 30% | 25% | 24% | 25% | 23% | 28% |
| Special education | 8% | 7% | 8% | 7% | 6% | 10% |
| Limited English language proficiency | 6% | 10% | 11% | 15% | 12% | 14% |
| Whole school proficient in reading | 66% | 62% | 68% | 70% | 78% | 84% |
| Whole school proficient in math | 34% | 39% | 54% | 68% | 75% | 79% |

| Liliuokalani Percentages | Spring 2005 | Spring 2006 | Spring 2007 | Spring 2008 | Spring 2009 | Spring 2010 |
|---|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|
| Economically disadvantaged | 49% | 47% | 38% | 35% | 33% | 35% |
| Special education | 24% | 22% | 18% | 16% | 11% | 14% |
| Limited English language proficiency | 8% | 7% | 9% | 10% | 10% | 10% |
| Whole school proficient in reading | 42% | 50% | 59% | 58% | 61% | 62% |
| Economically disadvantaged, proficient in reading | n/a | n/a | n/a | n/a | n/a | n/a |
| Whole school proficient in math | 32% | 41% | 52% | 48% | 58% | 50% |
| Economically disadvantaged, proficient in math | n/a | n/a | n/a | n/a | n/a | n/a |

| Waiialae Percentages | Spring 2005 | Spring 2006 | Spring 2007 | Spring 2008 | Spring 2009 | Spring 2010 |
|--------------------------------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|
| Economically disadvantaged | 14% | 21% | 21% | 25% | 24% | 24% |
| Special education | 4% | 3% | 4% | 4% | 3% | 6% |
| Limited English language proficiency | 15% | 6% | 9% | 8% | 6% | 8% |
| Whole school proficient in reading | 69% | 58% | 72% | 72% | 70% | 76% |
| Whole school proficient in math | 29% | 32% | 51% | 53% | 54% | 53% |

| Waikiki Percentages | Spring 2005 | Spring 2006 | Spring 2007 | Spring 2008 | Spring 2009 | Spring 2010 |
|--------------------------------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|
| Economically disadvantaged | 37% | 41% | 40% | 38% | 38% | 42% |
| Special education | 6% | 7% | 7% | 7% | 9% | 8% |
| Limited English language proficiency | 18% | 22% | 24% | 32% | 31% | 31% |
| Whole school proficient in reading | 78% | 68% | 73% | 72% | 72% | 77% |
| Whole school proficient in math | 55% | 55% | 69% | 68% | 63% | 72% |

| Wilson Percentages | Spring 2005 | Spring 2006 | Spring 2007 | Spring 2008 | Spring 2009 | Spring 2010 |
|--------------------------------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|
| Economically disadvantaged | 10% | 10% | 9% | 8% | 9% | 13% |
| Special education | 8% | 7% | 7% | 8% | 6% | 9% |
| Limited English language proficiency | 7% | 7% | 7% | 8% | 6% | 8% |
| Whole school proficient in reading | 67% | 73% | 72% | 77% | 82% | 82% |
| Whole school proficient in math | 42% | 57% | 64% | 73% | 77% | 77% |

Source: student demographics: School Status & Improvement Reports, 2006 and 2009; Student Information System roster as of 3/30/10 for 2010.

Source: student proficiency: ARCH NCLB reports

2. Achievement gap between students who are economically disadvantaged and students who are not economically disadvantaged (note: data are not available for four schools because the number of economically disadvantaged students is too low (fewer than 40 in grades 3-6) to report this data separately).

| Liholiho Percentages | Spring 2005 | Spring 2006 | Spring 2007 | Spring 2008 | Spring 2009 | Spring 2010 |
|---|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|
| Economically disadvantaged | 30% | 25% | 24% | 25% | 23% | 28% |
| Special education | 8% | 7% | 8% | 7% | 6% | 10% |
| Limited English language proficiency | 6% | 10% | 11% | 15% | 12% | 14% |
| Whole school proficient in reading | 66% | 62% | 68% | 70% | 78% | 84% |
| Not economically disadvantaged, proficient in reading | n/a | n/a | n/a | n/a | n/a | 95% |
| Economically disadvantaged, proficient in reading | n/a | n/a | n/a | n/a | n/a | 68% |
| Proficiency gap, reading | n/a | n/a | n/a | n/a | n/a | -27 pct pts |
| Whole school proficient in math | 29% | 32% | 51% | 53% | 54% | 79% |
| Not economically disadvantaged, proficient in math | n/a | n/a | n/a | n/a | n/a | 93% |
| Economically disadvantaged, proficient in math | n/a | n/a | n/a | n/a | n/a | 59% |
| Proficiency gap, math | n/a | n/a | n/a | n/a | n/a | -34 pct pts |

| Waiālae Percentages | Spring 2005 | Spring 2006 | Spring 2007 | Spring 2008 | Spring 2009 | Spring 2010 |
|---|--------------------|--------------------|--------------------|--------------------|--------------------|--------------------|
| Economically disadvantaged | 14% | 21% | 21% | 25% | 24% | 24% |
| Special education | 4% | 3% | 4% | 4% | 3% | 3% |
| Limited English language proficiency | 15% | 6% | 9% | 8% | 6% | 6% |
| Whole school proficient in reading | 69% | 58% | 72% | 72% | 70% | 76% |
| Not economically disadvantaged, proficient in reading | n/a | n/a | 70% | 73% | 72% | n/a |
| Economically disadvantaged, proficient in reading | n/a | n/a | 78% | 70% | 71% | n/a |
| Proficiency gap, reading | n/a | n/a | +8 pct pts | -3 pct pts | -1 pct pts | n/a |
| Whole school proficient in math | 29% | 32% | 51% | 53% | 54% | 53% |
| Not economically disadvantaged, proficient in math | n/a | n/a | 50% | 52% | 56% | n/a |
| Economically disadvantaged, proficient in math | n/a | n/a | 55% | 55% | 49% | n/a |
| Proficiency gap, math | n/a | n/a | +5 pct pts | +3 pct pts | -7 pct pts | n/a |

| Waikiki Percentages | Spring 2005 | Spring 2006 | Spring 2007 | Spring 2008 | Spring 2009 | Spring 2010 |
|---|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|
| Economically disadvantaged | 37% | 41% | 40% | 38% | 38% | 42% |
| Special education | 6% | 7% | 7% | 7% | 9% | 8% |
| Limited English language proficiency | 18% | 22% | 24% | 32% | 31% | 31% |
| Whole school proficient in reading | 78% | 68% | 73% | 72% | 72% | 77% |
| Not economically disadvantaged, proficient in reading | | 71% | 76% | 77% | 79% | 80% |
| Economically disadvantaged, proficient in reading | n/a | 63% | 68% | 63% | 61% | 73% |
| Proficiency gap, reading | | -8 pct pts | -8 pct pts | -14 pct pts | -18 pct pts | -7 pct pts |
| Whole school proficient in math | 55% | 55% | 69% | 68% | 63% | 72% |
| Not economically disadvantaged, proficient in math | | 57% | 74% | 73% | 69% | 81% |
| Economically disadvantaged, proficient in math | n/a | 52% | 62% | 60% | 53% | 60% |
| Proficiency gap, math | | -5 pct pts | -12 pct pts | -13 pct pts | -16 pct pts | -21 pct pts |

Note: if students with limited English proficiency are disproportionately economically disadvantaged, the proficiency gaps are likely to be overstated.

3. Percentage of students as of March 30, 2010 receiving special education services in the six schools:

| | Total enrollment, OEC date | General education 3/30/10 | Special education 3/30/10 | Total 3/30/10 | Percent special education 3/30/10 |
|--------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|---------------------------|---------------|-----------------------------------|
| Kahala | 443 | 389 | 33 | 422 | 7.8 |
| Liholiho | 356 | 325 | 36 | 361 | 10.0 |
| Liliuokalani | 127 | 119 | 19 | 138 | 13.8 |
| Waialae | 406 | 376 | 25 | 401 | 6.2 |
| Waikiki | 426 | 396 | 35 | 431 | 8.1 |
| Wilson | 550 | 511 | 51 | 562 | 9.1 |
| Total | 2,308 | 2,116 | 199 | 2,315 | 6.6 |

Source: Student Information System roster as of 3/30/10.

Table 4 – facility details

| | Kahala | | Liholiho | | Liliuokalani | |
|---|--------------|---------------|--------------|---------------|--------------|---------------|
| | Number | Sq.ft. | Number | Sq.ft. | Number | Sq.ft. |
| Classrooms: | | | | | | |
| Median Classroom Size | | 944 | | 900 | | 856 |
| Basic Program Needs (e.g., preK-12, SPED) | 26.00 | | 19.00 | 17,387 | 9.00 | 8,555 |
| Temporary Support (e.g., computer lab, library, day adult ed, etc.) | | | 1.00 | 870 | 1.00 | 841 |
| Supplemental Programs (e.g., core, music, ESLL, IRA, PSAP, etc.) | 4.25 | | 5.00 | 4,410 | 2.00 | 1,740 |
| DOE Support (e.g., A+, athletics, SAC, PCNC, SBBH, etc.) | 0.25 | | 2.00 | 2,284 | | 0 |
| DOE and Other Offices (e.g., ASA, complex/district/state DOE offices, etc.) | 0.50 | | | 0 | 12.00 | 9,396 |
| Vacant | 1.00 | | | 0 | | 0 |
| Total Classrooms | 32.00 | 30,206 | 27.00 | 7,564 | 24.00 | 20,532 |
| Admin/Library Bldgs | | 8,902 | | 6,317 | | 7,021 |
| Cafeteria/Kitchen Bldgs | | 7,176 | | 4,486 | | 4,859 |
| Total, Admin/Library/ Cafeteria/Kitchen | | 16,078 | | 10,783 | | 12,872 |

| | Waiialae | | Waikiki | | Wilson | |
|---|--------------|--------|--------------|---------------|--------------|---------------|
| | Number | Sq.ft. | Number | Sq.ft. | Number | Sq.ft. |
| Classrooms: | | | | | | |
| Median Classroom Size | | | | 1,020 | | 1,024 |
| Basic Program Needs (e.g., preK-12, SPED) | 24.50 | | 20.00 | | 25.00 | |
| Temporary Support (e.g., computer lab, library, day adult ed, etc.) | 1.00 | | 1.00 | | 1.00 | |
| Supplemental Programs (e.g., core, music, ESLL, IRA, PSAP, etc.) | 4.75 | | 3.00 | | 3.00 | |
| DOE Support (e.g., A+, athletics, SAC, PCNC, SBBH, etc.) | 0.75 | | | | | |
| DOE and Other Offices (e.g., ASA, complex/district/state DOE offices, etc.) | | | | | | |
| Vacant | | | | | | |
| Total Classrooms | 31.00 | | 24.00 | 24,470 | 29.00 | 29,700 |
| Admin/Library Bldgs | | | | 6,528 | | 5,839 |
| Cafeteria/Kitchen Bldgs | | | | 6,919 | | 7,696 |
| Total, Admin/Library/ Cafeteria/Kitchen | | | | 13,447 | | 13,535 |

DOE's criteria for determining the number of classrooms needed for instructional purposes are:

- * one classroom for each special education teacher
- * one classroom for every 20 students grades K-2
- * one classroom for every 25 students grades 3-12.

5. Financial savings

| Savings from closure of Liliuokalani and equal division of its students between Liholiho and Waialae | | |
|---|---------|---------|
| Elimination of Liliuokalani small school adjustment | 170,472 | |
| Reduction of Liholiho small school adjustments | 68,143 | |
| Total weighted student formula savings | 238,615 | |
| Fringe benefits @ 40.66% of 96% | 93,140 | 331,755 |
| Elimination of non-WSF positions (based on SY 09-10) | | |
| School health aide (incl fringes) | | 37,841 |
| Special education teacher | | |
| Educational assistant | | |
| Part-time school food services van driver and part-time helper | | |
| Food service van (operating costs) | | |
| Food service van & equipment (\$37,500, 7 year life) | | |
| Gross savings | | |
| Offsets | | none |
| Net savings | | 369,596 |

6. Current and backlogged facilities projects at Liliuokalani:

Current projects (funds are available)

| Project Number | Project Name | Type | Status | Total Estimated Cost |
|-----------------------|---------------------------------|-------------|---------------|-----------------------------|
| E0103371 | E INSTL OUTLETS | R&M | Construction | 4,000 |
| E0104148 | B INSTL OUTLETS | R&M | Construction | 16,000 |
| E0104352 | Bldg E Replace A/C Air Handlers | R&M | Construction | 150,000 |
| E0106473 | 03 RESRF PKG LOT | R&M | Construction | 0 |
| E0106474 | D Replace Grease Trap | R&M | | 100,000 |
| E0120463 | FURNITURE RPLMNT | R&M | | 3,000 |
| E0120928 | RPL WATER LINE | R&M | | 140,000 |
| E0121310 | B Renovate Pre-Sch R/Rm | R&M | | 50,000 |
| E0121453 | B Replace Sink Cabinets | R&M | | 100,000 |
| X0000834 | R406/416, Instl Dr & Wall Pnl | | Construction | 0 |
| X2501207 | BA & BB ACM ABATEMENT | | Construction | 0 |
| | total | | | 563,000 |

Backlog (not yet funded)

| Project Number | Project Name | Type | Status | Total Estimated Cost |
|-----------------------|--------------------------------------|-------------|---------------|-----------------------------|
| E0100407 | E RPNT INT | R&M | Backlog | 20,000 |
| E0103804 | RR RPR SPRINKLER SYS | R&M | Backlog | 20,000 |
| E0106470 | B RENO R/RM | R&M | Backlog | 350,000 |
| E0106471 | C RENO R/RM | R&M | Backlog | 350,000 |
| E0106472 | D RENO R/RM | R&M | Backlog | 120,000 |
| E0120929 | RPL BBALL BACKBDS | R&M | Backlog | 20,000 |
| E0121063 | D, Instl Exhuast Vents | R&M | Backlog | 50,000 |
| E0121418 | E Electrical Repairs | R&M | Backlog | 10,000 |
| E0121574 | OutDoor Stage , Install Flood Lights | R&M | Backlog | 10,000 |
| E0121573 | Campus Unified Communication System | R&M | Backlog | 140,000 |
| C0002372 | ADA Transition Accessibility | CIP | Backlog | 375,000 |
| C0002579 | Air Condition School | CIP | Backlog | 2,500,000 |
| | total | | | 3,965,000 |